

LOCAL HYBRID NEWSPAPERS TYPOLOGY: THREE CASES FROM RADAR MEDIA GROUP MEMBERS IN INDONESIA

¹Budi NUGRAHA, ²Udi RUSADI, ³Jamalullail JAMALULLAIL

^{1,3}Graduate School of Communication Science Doctoral Program, Sahid University Jakarta, Indonesia

²Institute of Social and Political Sciences Jakarta, Indonesia

Corresponding author: Budi Nugraha

Email: nugrahabudi470@gmail.com

Volume: 3

Number: 3

Page: 729 - 740

Article History:

Received: 2022-07-18

Revised: 2022-08-16

Accepted: 2022-11-11

Abstract:

The survival of print media in the internet and social media era is increasingly threatened, especially with the increase in paper prices and the shift of advertisers to online media. One common strategy that print newspapers adopt is to establish an online version of the print newspaper and, accordingly, become a hybrid newspaper. This paper explores how three hybrid local newspapers in Indonesia reacted to the challenges of digitalization in three different market structures: monopolistic, duopoly, and oligopoly. We see this as a form of media behavior in dealing with market structures formulated in the structure-conduct-performance (SCP) paradigm. The analysis attempts to find a typology of local hybrid newspapers based on the three interrelated components of SCP. The data of this study were obtained from interviews with top management of the three newspapers, accompanied by primary and secondary literature studies. The study found different practices of the three newspapers responding to their respective markets in terms of organizational structure, content, and support channels, online and offline. It allows us to formulate three types of mixed media: social hybrid media, business hybrid media, and Omni hybrid media. Strategy carried out by the business hybrid media allows gain profits and improve employee welfare.

Keywords: Hybrid Newspaper, Market Structure, Complementarity Hypothesis, Local Newspaper, Indonesia.

Cite this as: NUGRAHA, B., RUSADI, U., JAMALULLAIL. (2022). "Local Hybrid Newspapers Typology: Three Cases From Radar Media Group Members In Indonesia." *International Journal of Environmental, Sustainability, and Social Sciences*, 3 (3), 729 - 740.



INTRODUCTION

The emergence of information technology and the movement to reduce paper use poses a major challenge for print media to survive in today's era (Finneman et al., 2021; Finneman & Thomas, 2021). The unexpected crisis brought about by the Covid-19 pandemic was also the cause of the collapse of various print media (Hess & Waller, 2021). One strategy print newspapers commonly adopt establishing an online version of the print newspaper. The efforts of print media to build networks on online lines are included in the concept of convergence. Convergence combines communication, data, and information into one container (Hackley & Hackley, 2019). Convergence is the interconnection of information and media content due to digitalization and computer networks (Almeida-Santana et al., 2018).

There are two conflicting hypotheses regarding the convergence of print and online media today. According to the displacement hypothesis, online media compete to replace traditional media (Dimmick et al., 2004; Mbozi, 2021; Sung & Kim, 2020). The displacement hypothesis is counterproductive for print newspapers because it fails to capitalize on the advantages of printed newspapers. It has an impact on the abandonment of printed newspapers by readers. Therefore,

many online newspapers cannot promote the print version's viability. An alternative hypothesis to the displacement hypothesis is the complementary hypothesis. As the name implies, this hypothesis emphasizes online media's vital role in supporting print media's survival. It is under the concept of spatialization, an extension of a particular space, in this case, virtual space. As an expansion, the old territory held by the print media will not be replaced but will be supplemented so that the total area controlled by the media is wider.

Explores the convergence strategy carried out by three print media in Indonesia – Radar Surabaya, Radar Solo, and Radar Jogja. The specific aim is to explain the pattern of convergence with an SCP (Structure-Conduct-Performance) (Siegert et al., 2011) theoretical stance. Much research has been dedicated to studying print media convergence (Chyi & Tenenboim, 2017; Hassan & Azmi, 2018; Li & Thorson, 2018). The question then is, what is the proper way for online newspapers to provide support for print newspapers? It is still an open question that requires exploration in cases of hybrid newspapers. Hybrid newspapers are newspapers that operate on two legs, namely print and online. Ideally, hybrid newspapers can normally run, not lame. Of course, requires a well-coordinated strategy so that each leg can support the other and allow the company to run in the constantly changing environment as it is today.

The SCP paradigm argues that there is a linear relationship between the industry structure, the behavior of market players, and the performance of these market players. Therefore, this paper studies the local hybrid newspaper acts as the response to market structure and its impact on hybrid newspaper performance. It is achieved by addressing the following question: what is the structure of the hybrid newspaper market? How will the Radar hybrid newspaper conduct itself in response to the market structure? Furthermore, how will the hybrid media perform due to this strategy? We investigate three hybrid newspapers in Indonesia with different market structures: Radar Surabaya working in a monopolistic market, Radar Solo in a duopolistic market, and Radar Jogja in an oligopolistic market. It is done through primary analysis of interviews with top management and secondary analysis of internal and external documents.

Exploration of hybrid newspaper cases has theoretical, empirical, and practical significance. Theoretically, there is a real need for theory development in hybrid newspapers. Albarran (2019), for example, asks that media economics research is no longer just descriptive and becomes more theoretical, including developing new theories that combine media science and economics approaches (Albarran, 2019). Empirically, Cunningham (2018) highlights the importance of further research to answer whether print newspapers can survive in the next decade (the 2020s) and what can support their survival in that decade. Practically speaking, there is an urgency to save the print media that are still left today and allow hybrid newspapers to run normally. Section 2 outlines the concept and research on hybrid newspapers. Our chosen research approach is presented and discussed in Section 3. Section 4 presents the analysis of the three Radar newspapers' structure, conduct, and performance. Section 5 discusses the findings, outlines our contribution, and Section 6 concludes the paper.

Theory and research on hybrid newspaper. A newspaper is defined as a publication usually in the form of a sheet in which a substantial part of its content is provided for information on current events and news for general interest, and is intended for general circulation and published periodically at short intervals, usually weekly or more frequently (Leckner, 2007). Leckner (2007) views that there are two versions of newspapers: print and electronic. Printed newspapers are newspapers that are published on paper that is printed with ink. Electronic newspapers are newspapers published in electronic form, requiring electronic devices, an application (software), and some kind of connection (one or two-way). There are two types of electronic newspapers: online and offline. An online newspaper (on the network) is a news site managed by a company

with the same brand, managerially connected to print newspapers but does not have to have the same news content. Offline newspapers are full copies of the printed version and can be read by downloading PDF (Portable Document Format) or similar forms such as e-paper or epub.

Meanwhile, Tang et al. (2011) define hybrid newspapers as printed newspapers with accompanying websites. If it is associated with the definition of Leckner (2007), hybrid newspapers are print and online newspapers. However, to facilitate reading, this paper uses the terms printed newspaper and offline newspaper. Printed newspapers must be accessed outside the internet network, while offline newspapers must be accessed entirely via an internet connection. Offline newspapers, in the sense of Leckner (2007), such as PDF newspapers or e-papers in this paper are also classified as online newspapers because the first access is obtained online. However, once downloaded, they can be read without an internet connection.

The advent of hybrid newspapers was a way to cover the growing loss of print newspaper revenues. The alternative for print newspapers to survive without an online version is less favorable to the public interest of quality journalism. A study by Wang & Sparks (2019) found that the strategies taken to deal with declining revenues in print newspapers were threefold: (1) reorganizing and tightening departments, (2) opening new businesses that were not related to news, and (3) asking journalists to more oriented to the direct commercial task of covering news and compromising journalistic principles. So, if they want to maintain the quality of the news, printed newspapers have to build an online version or migrate to an online space under the current situation. Tang et al. (2011) found that investment in online versions increased the revenue for the print version of the newspaper mediated by the revenue from subscribing to the print version, controlling for quality factors.

The relationship between the number of print subscribers and print advertising revenue is intuitive and has long been recognized. Research shows that a 1% increase in the number of print newspaper subscribers is associated with a 1.28% increase in revenue from advertising in the print newspaper (Tang et al., 2011). Tang et al. (2011) also found that the number of print newspaper subscribers increased the online version of newspaper advertising revenue. It is due to two factors: the existence of product complementarity and the spillover of brand equity. The online version of the news complements the print version of the news, and the well-known print media brands in the offline space allow online visitors to have more confidence in the online version of this print media.

What is still unknown then is how the reverse effect can arise from the online version, which can encourage the print version of the newspaper to be purchased by more people. According to Kaiser and Kongsted (2005), online newspapers can positively affect print newspapers by providing a good overview and idea about the print version or by offering a subscription to the print version. However, Kaiser and Kongsted (2005) also warn that the online version can also harm the print version if audiences from the print version switch to the online version so that print newspaper sales fall. Thurman and Fletcher (2020) found that this negative effect is like a snowball because it provides a chain reaction.

When a newspaper decides to go completely online and shut down the print version, there will be a drastic decrease in the number of visitors to the remaining online version rather than an increase. In their research, Thurman and Fletcher (2020) found that the decision to go online for New Musical Express magazine resulted in a 72% decrease in visitors. Another study showed that the Finnish financial newspaper Tallousanomat could reduce expenses and costs by switching to the online version and forgoing the print version, but at the same time experiencing a decrease of up to 75% of its revenue (Leurdijk et al., 2014). So, the only option left for hybrid newspapers to

survive was to keep both versions afloat instead of shutting down the print version and migrating to the online version.

While there is a need to understand in detail how the online version can support the print version, there has not been any research that has addressed this question in hybrid newspapers. What is surprising then is that, although Tang et al. (2011) claim that hybrid newspaper is a term that is becoming more and more trendy nowadays due to the development of online media, a review of the keyword "hybrid newspaper" results in very few journal articles on Google Scholar. Alsarraj (2011) compared the performance of hybrid newspapers with purely online newspapers. This study found that there were more visitors to purely online newspapers than to hybrid newspapers. The reason is that purely online newspapers have less censorship and are more interactive than hybrid newspapers. In addition, purely online newspapers have more images, animations, and links than hybrid newspapers. Purely online newspapers also have blogs and social networks linked to social media, while very few hybrid newspapers have them. The point is that purely online newspapers are more interactive than hybrid newspapers. It is a particular obstacle for online versions of hybrid newspapers to provide revenue and support for print newspapers.

The study of Li and Thorson (2018) specifically focuses on managing a hybrid newspaper but is more in the context of content than other contexts. As expected, the relationship between the print and online versions of newspapers in Li and Thorson's (2018) study is collaborative rather than competitive. It is reasonable for this research to find that managers differentiate between which news is worth offering in the print version and which news is worth offering in the online version because readers of the two versions of newspapers have different interests. It can then be managed through a digital workflow management system that integrates online and print versions of the workflow to make the work process more efficient and cost-effective (Leurdijk, 2014).

In this case, there are still open questions about how distribution management, environmental orientation, form/design, and HR are carried out to support collaboration between the print and online versions. Leurdijk (2014) emphasized that until the article was written, no business model could compensate for the lost revenue from printed newspapers. Print newspapers must deal with the costs of maintaining an offline version and investing in an online version. The advertising revenue generated from the online version is insufficient to cover the losses incurred by reduced subscribers to the print version. However, Leurdijk (2014) emphasizes the importance of hybrid newspapers to survive and thrive because newspapers operate on the economic, social, and political aspects. Newspapers contribute not only to the demand and supply of goods but also to intelligent citizenship. Based on the described description, the author chose to conduct a study entitled "Local Hybrid Newspapers Typology: Three Cases from Radar Media Group Members in Indonesia".

METHOD

This research uses the case study method. Case studies can be interpreted as a direct investigation method with a natural setting and focus on an event intensively and in detail (Yin, 2018). Every empirical research has at least an implicit design, if not an explicit one. The case study is the most suitable method for the investigative phase of a study because it prioritizes surveys and historical processes to explain causality. The plural case study includes three hybrid newspapers: Radar Surabaya, Radar Radar Yogya, and Radar Solo. These newspapers were chosen because they operate locally in Indonesia's two most populous provinces, namely Central Java and East Java.

Case study approaches generally involve pattern matching, explanation building, time-series analysis, logic models, and cross-case synthesis (Ridder, 2017; Yin, 2018). In this study, we used a cross-case synthesis technique, and the findings of each case should be viewed as a whole, not as a collection of variables as used in quantitative research. As a result, the cross-case synthesis will identify patterns within cases resulting in diversity and the conditions that drive that diversity rather than unifying them into a single model.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Types of Local Hybrid Newspapers. The findings of this study are that the three hybrid newspapers studied, Radar Surabaya, Radar Solo, and Radar Jogja follow different business patterns in response to a market structure that is declining in print and increasing in the online segment. In responding to the market structure that tends to be monopolistic, Radar Surabaya uses tactical integration coordinated in nature where two editors-in-chief are of equal standing, namely the print editor-in-chief and the online editor-in-chief. "For print media, the operational commander is directly under the editor-in-chief and the Korlip. While online media, of course, there is also a separate editor-in-chief". Radar Solo, managing the print and online versions is hierarchical. Here the coordinator of the online version is responsible for the chief editor of the print. "In the print version, Radar Solo is the same as Radar Jogja. The editors still handle it. While the online is still handled by the coordinator responsible to the editor in chief of print". Hybrid media integration on Radar Jogja seems ineffective. It is mainly reflected in the substitution perspective held by Radar Jogja by attributing the decline in print revenue to online media presence. "For the print edition, in line with the dimming of the national media, the advertising revenue of Radar Yogya's print edition has dimmed, although it still exists but has decreased by around 50 percent. It is due to the shift of readers from print to online, followed by the advertising market, which is also gradually shifting to the online edition. Do not forget that in Yogya, there are also many print media in Yogya Daily, Bernas, and the Yogya Tribune".

The three Radars studied follow different orientations on calls newspapers with a tendency to social media (including Twitter and Instagram), a Social Hybrid, channel-oriented hybrid media that provide direct advertising revenue as Business Hybrid, and hybrid newspaper that tries to focus on all channels Omni Hybrid. According to the results of their research, the current structure of the media market will ultimately force the media into two possible positions in the future: the media as public servants and the media as businesses. (Sjovaag & Krumsvik, 2018). As a public servant, the media encourages the media to produce platform-specific news, and there is little demand from the owner for profit. This medium employs fewer journalists and more freelancers. More revenue from new media and innovation is obtained from incumbents, predecessors, and parent shareholders. In this study, this model is in the hands of Radar Surabaya. Radar Surabaya's primary focus on new media is getting connections with the public and getting viral news. Facebook is the most viral content source compared to other social media (Dermendjieva & Slavova, 2018). However, they have not yet reached the level Sjovaag, and Krumsvik (2018) referred to because income is still primarily sourced from print media, not new media. The following table describes the differences between the three types of hybrid media as a contribution to this research can be seen in table 1.

Table 1. Local Hybrid Media Typology as the Findings of this Research

| Public Service Media | Business Media | Omni Media |
|----------------------|----------------|-------------|
| Radar Surabaya | Radar Solo | Radar Jogja |

| Public Service Media | Business Media | Omni Media |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------|
| Moderate income, just to survive | Income is expected to be high | Income is strived to increase |
| Traditional text-based print and new media orientation (Online media, Twitter, Facebook) | Economically profitable channel orientation (Print, online, and YouTube) | All channel orientations (audio, visual, textual) |
| Revenue from the print version | Revenue from the print and online version | Revenue from the online version |
| Minimum innovation | Optimum innovation | Maximum innovation |
| Serving the public even though it cannot be profitable | Serving the public only if the welfare of employees | Social and business aspects are balanced |
| Complementary hypothesis: online supports print | Complementary hypothesis: online supports print and print supports online | Substitution hypothesis: online replaces print |
| Monopolistic market structure | Duopoly market structure | Oligopoly market structure |

The second version is media as a business. In this case, the owner's high demand for high profit is high. Innovation comes from entrepreneurs and more users paying for journalism. Production is platform-independent. After the production is complete, the news is distributed to various platforms according to the platform's specifications. In this study, Radar Solo best reflects the media as a business.

Meanwhile, Radar Jogja is trying to operate on both legs: the media as a public servant and the media as a business. The purpose of this study is to reveal the strategy of the Radar hybrid newspaper in maintaining the sustainability of print media. This study finds that market structure determines whether the newspaper supports the complementarity or replacement hypothesis. Hybrid newspapers that work on a monopolistic market structure and a duopoly market show behaviors that support the complementarity hypothesis, while hybrid newspapers that work on an oligopoly market show behaviors that support the replacement hypothesis. This finding supports previous research where media more commonly use the complementarity hypothesis (Adoni & Nimrod, 2020; Jenkins & Nielsen, 2020; Li & Thorson, 2018; Lie, 2018; Neyazi et al., 2019). The media with the complementarity hypothesis can optimize the business strategy to achieve the expected profit.

Potential Effectiveness of Visual Strategies in All Markets. The all-channel strategy is resource-intensive because hybrid media must increase staff competence, skills, and innovation power, develop a new mindset, and create a new identity (Åkesson et al., 2018). Sometimes this also leads to competition between the print and online divisions and an imbalance in the allocation of resources between the two. In a conflict situation like this, it is wise to separate the online and print versions into two entities. Studies show that channel complementarity is something that can be done. Neyazi et al. (2019) show how exposure to traditional media predicts exposure to social media. In this case, it is print media that supports online media. Consumers bring the issues they find in print media and then discuss them online or look for more information online.

In an oligopoly situation, consumers have greater power in determining consumption than in a duopoly or monopoly situation. In this situation, the company's focus should also be oriented to the consumer focus. This focus, however, changes as technology develops. As a result, presence across all channels appears to be a reasonable solution for acquiring customers as consumer focus shifts. However, in an oligopoly and monopolistic market, the company's image becomes very important. Because there are many companies, consumers can rate and compare company values based on their perceived image of the company. Companies must not only be present where

consumers focus on these areas, but companies must also take steps to improve their image in the eyes of consumers. (Eigruber & Wirl, 2020).

The presence of image considerations poses a risk that the presence of specific channels can cannibalize others instead of creating synergies. Consumers choose only one channel and refuse to use other channels based on the image. This image may not come directly from the company but can come from the channel itself. Vandenplas and Picone's (2021) study of 3,965 Flemish (northern Belgium) residents aged 14-85 identified that society was divided into six groups based on media use. The first group is the traditional group that only consumes print and television media. They do not have social media accounts. Their proportion of the population is 18.7% (Vandenplas & Picone, 2021).

A second group is a group that only uses the internet for public purposes. Their number is 21.8% of the population. They consume both print and online news but tend to prefer print media. All online media consumed is the online version of the print media they read. That is, they are loyal to hybrid media when reading online media. The third group is enthusiastic about print and online media. They also consume online media sites, which are extensions of print media and tend to be online. These consumers are also classified as loyal to the newspaper brand. They are active on the Internet and Facebook but less active on Twitter. The proportion in the population is 19.4%. The fourth group is entertainment seekers. Entertainment seekers are also active on the Internet and Facebook and less on Twitter. They only use online media and do not consume print media. As many as 14% of the population belongs to this group. A fifth group is a group that likes everything. A total of 15.2% of the population is in this category. The fifth group is characterized by using any print or online media, independent of the brand.

They are not as active as the third and fourth groups using Facebook. The last group is quality seekers. Quality seeker groups are not active on social media but consume print and online media. They only choose one version for a brand they think is of better quality. For certain brands, they only read the online version, while for other brands, they only consume the printed version, even though the company offers them both versions. As many as 10.9% of the population is in this category.

This finding means that if the hybrid media leaves the print media, the hybrid media can lose 18.70% of the population because there are 18.7% of the population who can only access news through traditional media. Without print media, they entirely rely on television media and increase the competitiveness of television media against hybrid media.

This finding also means that 14% of the population that online media should target because they are not touched by print media. In addition, an online media presence will create a loyal group of 41.20% of the population. Those who initially consume print media will also use online media with the same brand. Meanwhile, those who initially only consume online media will also consume print media with the same brand. Of this, 41.20%, about half, or 19.4%, can be reached with the help of Facebook because they are active here. Facebook cannot help the remaining 21.80% because they are not active on this social media. The only way to be taken is to use online media as a reference to print media and vice versa; print media is used to refer to online media.

There is also 26.10% of the population with floating options. This population is not loyal to hybridity. Around 15.2% are the group who do not care and only have a proximity that allows them to consume online media or print media. As a result, hybrid media must increase the variety of news stories and the speed of access to attract readers' attention. The rest, 10.9%, are very selective and will only choose news sites or print media that they think are high quality. Facebook cannot help well for these two segments because their activity on this platform is not high.

Loyal groups in hybrid media indicate that the complementary hypothesis supports hybrid media competition. Furthermore, it also supports a multi-channel strategy, involving print media, online media, and Facebook. However, if the complementarity hypothesis does not support the multi-channel strategy, it will not be optimal. According to the author, this happened in the case of Radar Jogja. Radar Jogja uses a multi-channel strategy but uses the substitution hypothesis. As a result, there is inequality in reaching the population, and they cannot transfer the profits from new media to print media.

The efforts made by Radar Jogja to solve print media problems do not lead to existing problems but lead to consumers. Efforts to "bomb" consumers with news from online media are not directly related to efforts to reduce paper, pay taxes, print machine operations, increase print human resources, and operations in the field. Only if this news bombardment increases traffic and ad revenue will funds be available to solve the print media problem. However, this advantage is not necessarily given to support print media because online media has its own needs, such as improving technology infrastructure and expanding information. Radar Jogja covers the weaknesses of online media with news and blow-ups in the print version.

The print version is also expected to make the news as complete as possible. Attempts to refer to the print version with the phrase "read more in print" can be made in online news. However, this will be a problem if the printed version itself is not available in the hands of the public. Online media does help by making as much news as possible so that print media can make news as complete as possible, equipped with photos and infographics. But this also led to the initial problem, namely the need for paper and ink, which had not been resolved.

Instead of using a massive strategy of photos and infographics in the print version, the visual strategy puts the visual aspects digitally. It eliminates ink and print costs. This visual strategy can be implemented in online news and on the mobile version. In addition, comprehensive video coverage can be created on the YouTube channel. The news media YouTube channel does not only have to contain the latest news. However, it can also contain news on tourism promotions and positive government activities, as has been done by Radar Solo. Santin & Alvarez-Monzoncillo (2020) argue that the population is increasingly shifting from written text to video, and newspapers need to increase audience engagement by improving the quality of video production and video distribution strategies to survive in the digital ecosystem. Their study found that YouTube videos increased a newspaper's brand position in search engines, although they only contributed slightly to the company's revenue structure (Santín & Álvarez-Monzoncillo, 2020).

This strategy can be successful in an oligopoly context because Radar Jogja already has an active channel with high involvement. In addition, business strategies can be successful in the context of Radar Jogja by looking only at the channels that provide direct economic benefits. YouTube can provide immediate economic benefits because, apart from monetization, in-video and even video ads can be uploaded to YouTube. Advertisements about Radar Jogja in print can also be uploaded as separate videos or as inserts in the news. Facebook, Instagram, and Twitter can promote print newspapers or create links to online media or YouTube channels. Podcasts can be used for advertising as well as radio and print newspapers.

The primacy of YouTube and online news media to support print newspapers can be due to media richness (Andarwati et al., 2020) and audience anonymity (Davis, 2020). YouTube and online news media have great wealth because they can provide large and serious volumes of information. Social media such as Facebook, Twitter, and Instagram cannot accommodate this. YouTube, in particular, is a substitute for television for today's generation. Since the hybrid media business is based on information, it is only natural that YouTube and online news media are the options for making money for hybrid media. In addition, audience anonymity allows anyone to

read online news, watch YouTube, and comment on it without creating an account with a complete bio like on social media. The ease of use and reasonable privacy protections for online news and YouTube help drive advertisers' hybrid media revenue stream.

In addition, this can also be supported by agenda stability theory (Vonbun-Feldbauer & Matthes, 2018). According to agenda stability theory, the agenda can be divided into two: a stable problem agenda and a dynamic problem agenda. Whether a problem is stable or dynamic depends on two factors: the degree of space, background information, and immediacy. An issue is said to be stable if it has a high degree of space and background information with low immediacy. In contrast, an issue is said to be dynamic if it has a high degree of immediacy and low background information.

Vonbun-Feldbauer and Matthes (2018) show that stable problems are best distributed by printed newspapers, while news broadcasts best channel dynamic problems. Online newspapers are at the frontier, especially at the point where the degree of space and background information is high and the immediacy is high. In this case, online newspapers are a kind of bridge that can channel information needs quickly and in-depth that printed newspapers and news broadcasts cannot cover. That is, if there is an event, it can fall into one of three categories:

- a. News that requires a degree of space and in-depth background information is not immediate. This stable issue is suitable to be reported by printed newspapers. When issues become more dynamic, audiences can be referred to online newspapers and news broadcasts.
- b. News requires little space and background information but is relatively immediate. This dynamic issue is suitable for reporting by YouTube newscasts. As news stabilizes, it can be spread to print newspapers and online news media.
- c. News that requires a high degree of space and background information must be reported immediately. The issue between stable and dynamic is suitable for reporting by online news media. As news becomes more dynamic, information from online newspapers can be used to build stories in news broadcasts. On the other hand, when news is more stable, information from online newspapers can be used to build new in print newspapers.

In addition, this empirical finding shows that the existing hybrid newspapers' behavior is still unable to optimally support the print version with the online version, which has developed quite well. This finding shows that there is still ample room for improvement to maximize hybrid media business behavior in winning the competition in the market they face. In addition, this study supports the finding that hybrid newspapers are still unable to seize the opportunities offered by advances in communication and information technology (Heckman & Wihbey, 2019).

This research also reveals that printed newspapers still have a place in people's hearts and provide substantial advantages for hybrid media. This advantage is even higher than the advantages provided by online media. The profits are declining, but the newspaper with the complementary hypothesis sees it as a coordination challenge that must be solved with hard work and collaboration with online media. The finding that print media still has a place in people's hearts is also shown by the growth rate of the number of print media, which is proportional to the growth rate of online media. This finding supports previous research, which shows that print media has particular advantages that cannot be replaced by online media (Chyi & Tenenboim, 2019; Hassan & Azmi, 2018).

CONCLUSIONS

The reports on three cases of local hybrid newspapers conducted in Indonesia addressed the challenge of changing information technology. The research investigates the different firm behaviors under different market conditions. The cases offer good examples of organizational

response to monopolistic, duopoly, and oligopoly markets. The analysis results conclude that there are three types of hybrid media: social hybrid media, business hybrid media, and Omni hybrid media. This finding shows that ambidexterity (Jenkins & Nielsen, 2020), namely an organization's ability to carry out multiple focuses and build synergies between the two focuses, takes various forms. Therefore, the results of this qualitative and quantitative data analysis support previous findings through interviews (Finneman et al., 2021; Sjøvaag & Krumsvik, 2018) and surveys (Vandenplas & Picone, 2021) that strategies to maintain the viability of printed newspapers take various forms. Moreover, these findings support recent research on the future of the media industry, which found that the future media will have two scenarios: public-serving and business-oriented media (Sjøvaag & Krumsvik, 2018).

This research contributes to media economics and communication science by finding that hybrid media can have a public service orientation, a mixed orientation, and business orientation. The surprising finding is that Omni hybrid media are no more viable than social and business hybrid media. It can be attributed to the excessive (maximum) strategy in utilizing technology. The minimal social hybrid media strategy allows the hybrid media to focus on its survival. In contrast, the optimal strategy carried out by the business hybrid media allows the hybrid media to gain profits and improve employee welfare.

REFERENCE

- Adoni, H., & Nimrod, G. (2020). The Emergence of the Hybrid Older Reader: A Cross-National Study. *Communications*, 45(4), 414–439. <https://doi.org/10.1515/commun-2019-2033>
- Åkesson, M., Sørensen, C., & Eriksson, C. I. (2018). Ambidexterity Under Digitalization: A Tale of Two Decades of New Media at A Swedish Newspaper. *Scandinavian Journal of Management*, 29.
- Albarran, A. B. (2010). *The Media Economy* (1. publ). Routledge.
- Albarran, A. B. (2019). Media Economics Research: A History of the Field. In A. Albarran, A Research Agenda for Media Economics (pp. 1–12). *Edward Elgar Publishing*. <https://doi.org/10.4337/9781788119061.00006>
- Almeida-Santana, A., Moreno, S., & Boza, J. (2018). The Paradox of Cultural and Media Convergence. Segmenting the European Tourist Market by Information Sources and Motivations. *Journal of Tourism Research*, 20(5), 613–625.
- Alsarraj, A. (2011). Online News Services among Jordanian Universities Students: A Comparison Study Between Hybrid & Pure Online News Websites. *Middle East University*.
- Andarwati, M., Assih, P., Amrullah, F., Putri, D. M., & Thamrin, E. (2020). The success of Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs): Actual Technology Use in e-Marketplace Based on Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) Analysis. *2020 6th International Conference on Education and Technology (ICET)*, 142–147. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ICET51153.2020.9276594>
- Chyi, H. I., & Tenenboim, O. (2017). Reality Check: Multiplatform Newspaper Readership in the United States, 2007–2015. *Journalism Practice*, 11(7), 798–819. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2016.1208056>
- Chyi, H. I., & Tenenboim, O. (2019). Charging More and Wondering Why Readership Declined? A Longitudinal Study of U.S. Newspapers' Price Hikes, 2008–2016. *Journalism Studies*, 20(14), 2113–2129. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2019.1568903>
- Cunningham, B. (2018). *Evolving Research and Theories in Media Economics*. In A. B. Albarran, B. Mierzejewska, & J. Jung (Eds.), *Handbook of Media Management and Economics* (2nd Edition, Pp. 36–51). Routledge.
- Davis, I. (2020). "Es Verdad hay q matarlas a todas": Online discourse surrounding "e" as a gender-

- neutral morpheme in Spanish.* Youngstown State University.
- Dermendjieva, G., & Slavova, R. (2018). Online Sharing Platforms as a Medium for the Emergence of Viral Content. *PEOPLE: International Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(2), 177–199. <https://doi.org/10.20319/pijss.2018.42.177199>
- Dimmick, J., Chen, Y., & Li, Z. (2004). Competition Between the Internet and Traditional News Media: The Gratification-Opportunities Niche Dimension. *Journal of Media Economics*, 17(1), 19–33. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15327736me1701_2
- Eigruber, M., & Wirl, F. (2020). Cheating as a dynamic marketing strategy in monopoly, cartel, and duopoly. *Central European Journal of Operations Research*, 28(2), 461–478. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10100-019-00652-x>
- Finneman, T., Mari, W., & Thomas, R. J. (2021). "I Did not Know How We Were Going to Survive": U.S. Community Newspapers' Resilience During COVID-19. *Journalism Practice*, 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2021.1957703>
- Finneman, T., & Thomas, R. J. (2021). "Our Company is in Survival Mode": Metajournalistic Discourse on COVID-19's Impact on U.S. Community Newspapers. *Journalism Practice*, 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2021.1888149>
- Hackley, C., & Hackley, A. R. (2019). Advertising at the Threshold: Paratextual Promotion in the Era of Media Convergence. *Marketing Theory*, 19(2), 195–215. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1470593118787581>
- Hassan, I., & Azmi, M. N. L. (2018). Readers' Preferences for Print and Online Newspapers in Northwestern Nigeria. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 8(6), Pages 965-974. <https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBS/v8-i6/4294>
- Heckman, M., & Wihbey, J. (2019). The Local-Mobile Paradox: Missed Innovation Opportunities at Local Newspapers. *Newspaper Research Journal*, 40(3), 317–328. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0739532919835610>
- Hess, K., & Waller, L. J. (2021). Local Newspapers and Coronavirus: Conceptualising Connections, Comparisons, and Cures. *Media International Australia*, 178(1), 21–35. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1329878X20956455>
- Jenkins, J., & Nielsen, R. K. (2020). Preservation and Evolution: Local Newspapers as Ambidextrous Organizations. *Journalism*, 21(4), 472–488. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1464884919886421>
- Kaiser, U., & Kongsted, H. C. (2005). Do Magazines' "Companion Websites" Cannibalize the Demand for the Print Version? *SSRN Electronic Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.774785>
- Leckner, S. (2007). *Is the Medium the Message?* [Disertasi Doktor]. KTH.
- Leurdijk, A., Nieuwenhuis, O., & Poel, M. (2014). *The Newspaper Industry*. In G. De Prato, E. Sanz, & J. P. Simon (Eds.), *Digital Media Worlds* (pp. 147–162). Palgrave Macmillan UK. <https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137344250>
- Li, Y., & Thorson, E. (2018). Converting Cultural Capital into Economic Capital: A Hybrid Newspaper's Content Management and Performance During Economic Turbulence. *Journal of Media Business Studies*, 15(1), 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/16522354.2018.1445159>
- Lie, M. P. (2018). Local Newspapers, Facebook and Local Civic Engagement: A Study of Media Use in Two Norwegian Communities. *Nordicom Review*, 39(2), 49–62. <https://doi.org/10.2478/nor-2018-0011>
- Mbozi, P. (2021). Displacement and Substitutability Effects of Online Newspapers on Traditional Media: A Zambian Perspective. In H. S. Dunn, D. Moyo, W. O. Lesitaokana, & S. B. Barnabas (Eds.), *Re-imagining Communication in Africa and the Caribbean* (pp. 235–254). *Springer International Publishing*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-54169-9_13

- Neyazi, T. A., Kumar, A., & Dutta, M. J. (2019). Channel Complementarity or Displacement? Theory and Evidence from a non-Western Election Context. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*, 63(4), 656–676. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08838151.2019.1689072>
- Ramstad, G. O. (1997). A Model for Structural Analysis of the Media Market. *Journal of Media Economics*, 10(3), 45–50. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15327736me1003_4
- Ridder, H.-G. (2017). The Theory Contribution of Case Study Research Designs. *Business Research*, 10(2), 281–305. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40685-017-0045-z>
- Santín, M., & Álvarez-Monzoncillo, J.-M. (2020). The use of YouTube by the Spanish press: A model to be defined. *El Profesional de La Información*, 29(1). <https://doi.org/10.3145/epi.2020.ene.16>
- Siebert, G., Gerth, M. A., & Rademacher, P. (2011). Brand Identity-Driven Decision Making by Journalists and Media Managers-The MBAC Model as a Theoretical Framework. *International Journal on Media Management*, 13(1), 53–70. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14241277.2010.545363>
- Sjøvaag, H., & Krumsvik, A. H. (2018). In Search of Journalism Funding: Scenarios for future media policy in Norway. *Journalism Practice*, 12(9), 1201–1219. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2017.1370972>
- Sung, N., & Kim, J. (2020). Does the internet kill newspapers? The case of South Korea. *Telecommunications Policy*, 44(4), 101955. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.telpol.2020.101955>
- Tafesse, W., & Kitchen, P. J. (2017). IMC – an integrative review. *International Journal of Advertising*, 36(2), 210–226. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02650487.2015.1114168>
- Tang, Y. (Elina), Sridhar, S. (Hari), Thorson, E., & Mantrala, M. K. (2011). The Bricks That Build the Clicks: Newsroom Investments and Newspaper Online Performance. *International Journal on Media Management*, 13(2), 107–128. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14241277.2011.568420>
- Thurman, N., & Fletcher, R. (2020). Effects of a Magazine’s Move to Online-only: Post-print Audience Attention and Readership Retention Revisited. *Journalism Practice*, 14(10), 1225–1243. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2019.1685903>
- Vandenplas, R., & Picone, I. (2021). Media as the Great Emancipators? Exploring Relations Between Media Repertoires and Cultural Participation in Flanders. *Convergence: The International Journal of Research into New Media Technologies*, 27(5), 1439–1461. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1354856521990246>
- Vonbun-Feldbauer, R., & Matthes, J. (2018). Do Channels Matter? : Investigating Media Characteristics in the Agenda-Building Process of an Election Campaign. *Journalism Studies*, 19(16), 2359–2378. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2017.1349547>
- Wang, H., & Sparks, C. (2019). Marketing Credibility: Chinese Newspapers’ Responses to Revenue Losses from Falling Circulation and Advertising Decline. *Journalism Studies*, 20(9), 1301–1318. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2018.1513815>
- Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case Study Research and Applications: Design and Methods* (Sixth edition). SAGE.