

Volume: 7
 Number: 3
 Page: 749 - 764

Article History:

Received: 2026-02-11
 Revised: 2026-03-15
 Accepted: 2026-04-29

**PARTICIPATIVE LEADERSHIP: ENHANCING OVERALL
 PERSONNEL PERFORMANCE OUTCOMES**

Heru Prasetyo¹, Priyanto Suharto

^{1,2}Universitas Pertahanan, Indonesia

Corresponding author: Heru Prasetyo

E-mail: heruprasetyo100@gmail.com

Abstract:

Personnel performance plays a very important role for every organization in realizing the work program targets that the organization, including military organizations, has set. This study aims to explore the determination of the Performance of Indonesian Army Military Personnel. In addition, this study examines the relationship between personnel performance influenced by Military Participative Leadership, Organizational Commitment and Remuneration. This research was conducted with a quantitative approach based on primary data. The research sample used was the Indonesian Army Central Executive Agency's Work Unit, with a size of 310 respondents. The statistical tool used in this study is SmartPLS 3. The results show that Military Participative Leadership, Organizational Commitment and Remuneration affect Personnel Performance. Furthermore, Organizational Commitment shows that it can mediate the relationship between Military Participative Leadership and Personal Performance. Furthermore, remuneration has also been shown to moderate the relationship between Military Participative Leadership and Personal Performance.

Keywords: Personal Performance, Military Participative Leadership, Organizational Commitment, Remuneration

INTRODUCTION

The phenomenon that occurs in this study is the performance of budget absorption within the Ministry of Defense, in this case, the Indonesian Military. The Ministry of Defense is the recipient of the second-largest budget portion of Rp. 108.36 trillion until the middle of the first quarter of 2019, absorbed only 6.62 percent of the budget. Therefore, the ideal portion for the first quarter period should be that the Ministry of Defense has absorbed the budget for implementing activities by 25 percent. This low absorption capacity illustrates that the performance of units within the Ministry of Defense has not been optimal because the low absorption capacity of the budget indicates weak supervision and monitoring of budget implementation by the Ministry of Defense's financial administration personnel. It indicates that there are interesting budget management problems for further research, especially the supervision of the performance of personnel involved in financial administration management. The low absorption capacity of the budget is caused by the lack of understanding of several apparatus regarding the mechanism for using the budget and its accountability model, and on the other hand, there is no reason for financial administration personnel to make mistakes or omissions in the management and use of the budget (Edward, 2016).

Personnel performance plays a very important role for every organization in realizing the work program targets that the organization has set (Campbell and Wiernik, 2015); individual performance in various organizational forms is a key factor in the success of the organization (Alshery et al., 2015). Many factors influence personnel performance, including leadership style, organizational Commitment, and compensation (Patiar and Wang, 2020). Research that shows that personnel performance is strongly influenced by leadership style is conveyed by Lumbasi et al. (2016), Mehrabi et al. (2013), Odoardi et al. (2018), Dalluay and Jalagat (2016), Alfanny (2018),



This open-access article is distributed under a
 Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY-NC) 4.0 license

Ebrahim (2018), Newman (2012), Rozy et al. (2019), Ikbal et al. (2015), Gholamreza et al. (2019), and Akpoviroro et al. (2018). The influence of leadership on performance will not work if there is no commitment built from internal motivation. Personnel performance is also strongly influenced by Commitment. A study by Jafri and Lhamo (2013) states that organizational commitment is a psychological status that binds an employee to an organization; there are situations where it is necessary to consider how important organization commitment is in shaping performance. It is shown by the research of Wright and Bonnet (2002), Jafri and Lhamo (2013), Folorunso (2014), Yamali (2018), Assumeraja (2007), Imamoglu et al. (2019), Suharto et al. (2019), Eliyana et al. (2019), Setiawan and Gunawan (2018) and Rose et al. (2009). The reason the researcher places organization commitment as an intervening variable in addition to the support of existing empirical research is that organizational Commitment has been ingrained in the identity of soldiers in the form of corps spirit bonds, unit pride and loyalty, so that they become the basic capital for military organizations in improving performance.

Personnel performance is also greatly influenced by the compensation system. According to Maslow's need hierarchy theory, fulfilling individual needs can ensure team members work optimally without being constrained by sensitive welfare issues affecting personnel performance. Several studies that reveal the effect of remuneration on performance include Musriyadi et al. (2015), Danuji and Rahadini (2012), Kyule et al. (2016) and Mitas et al. (2014). In addition, Yeh and Hong (2012) stated that managers must realize appropriate rewards or remuneration to achieve work goals. If the manager cannot fulfill the promise, negative feelings will arise and cause employees not to put in the effort for their work, and ultimately, performance will decline.

The selection of the Military participative leadership variable, as well as a new terminology in the realm of leadership in the military environment, is used to improve personnel performance because the personnel or financial administration employees of the Indonesian Army (starting now abbreviated as TNI AD) require a leadership style that can provide a conducive work situation and provide opportunities consultative. The research develops a leadership style that is not commonly used in the military environment, namely the participatory style of contingency leadership theory that emphasizes communication between leaders and subordinates. Some of these phenomena are increasingly convincing to form a new model of the relationship between the military participative leadership style and personnel performance in the military environment. The research gap formed from the results of the literature test on participative leadership variables and personnel performance became the author's strong capital to add organization commitment as a mediating variable. It is supported by research by Yousef (2000), Yeh and Hong (2012) and Steyrer et al. (2008), who succeeded in proving organization commitment as a mediator in this relationship. Furthermore, remuneration is placed as a moderating variable because, in "Maslow's need hierarchy theory," it is concluded that motivation is an important factor in improving personnel performance. Based on the description of the background and the phenomena that occur, the formulation of the problem that can be developed is as follows: 1) Does MPL affect the performance of the financial administration personnel of the central implementing agency of the TNI AD? 2) Does MPL affect the OC of the financial administration personnel of the TNI AD central implementing agency? 3) Does OC affect the performance of the financial administration personnel of the central implementing agency of the TNI AD? 4) Does the OC mediate the MPL on the performance of the financial administration personnel of the TNI AD central implementing agency? 5) Does remuneration moderate MPL on the performance of financial administration personnel of the central implementing agency of the Indonesian Army?



Literature Review. The increase in personnel performance, especially financial administration personnel in the work units of the Central Indonesian Army implementing agency, is measured by the absorption capacity of the budget in each work unit, so that there is no accumulation of activity implementation at the end of the fiscal year period. Therefore, the role of participative military leadership plays a real role in efforts to improve performance in the military environment, which generally prioritizes discipline and upright loyalty. However, research on the use of the Military Participative Leadership style in the military environment, especially the Indonesian Army, is still lacking or can be said to have never been done by previous researchers, although Hersey and Blanchard (1995) say that participative leadership is very flexible because it can be applied to almost any organization and anywhere following the need, even for military organizations, current research underscores that in certain parts of the military environment a Participative Leadership style can also be applied to improve personnel performance.

Military Participative leadership functions as an adhesive for the relationship between subordinates and superiors to reduce the bulkhead or coordination distance because it prioritizes massive communication. Iqbal et al. (2015), participative leadership involves all team members in identifying the main goals and developing procedures or strategies to achieve goals. Participative leadership always improves performance because it has potential benefits, as stated by Yukl (2008), among others: 1) high decision quality, 2) acceptance of decisions by followers is quite good, 3) satisfaction with the decision-making process, and 4) improvement in decision-making abilities of followers and teams.

So far, as stated above, not many or even none have researched participative military leadership on personnel performance, especially in the military environment, as stated by Raveendran and Gamage (2019) and Lord and Hasan (2017) that in the past, transactional and transformational styles were significantly developed. Moreover, has received much attention from researchers and has a broad spectrum, but along with changes in technology and communication, there has also been a shift in the need to conduct participative leadership research which has been proven to encourage performance improvement, such as research that has been carried out, among others; Lumbasi et al. (2016), Mehrabi et al. (2013), Odoardi et al. (2018); Dalluay et al. (2016), Alfanny (2018), Ebrahim (2018), Newman (2012), Rozy et al. (2019), Iqbal et al. (2015), and Gholamreza et al. (2019), Akpoviroro et al. (2018). According to Gholamreza et al. (2019), participative leadership is very effective in encouraging performance. Participative leadership has a significant effect on personnel performance and affects financial resources, product quality, personnel satisfaction, and innovation (Rozy et al., 2019). The empirical research strengthens the hypothesis built in this study, so that the following hypothesis is obtained:

H1. Military Participative leadership has been associated with Personnel Performance.

One measure of the success of human resource management is the strong organizational Commitment of personnel to the organization. Low turnover, a high sense of belonging to the organization, a spirit of togetherness or esprit de corp and the achievement of organizational goals are manifestations of the high level of organizational Commitment. In addition, organization commitment indicates the similarity of individual goals with organizations that can stimulate personnel productivity and loyalty (Chen and Aryee, 2007); in the military environment, organization commitment can be interpreted as a corporate spirit towards the unit in the form of devotion that exceeds the call of duty as well as love and loyalty to the unit that is assigned to it. Usually manifested in the form of a willingness to work tirelessly with limited resources.

Meyer and Allen (2004, in Tolentino, 2013) believe that a strong organizational commitment causes personnel to work hard to achieve organizational goals. Organizational Commitment has a

strong relationship with the behavior and performance of personnel (1997). The relationship between leadership and organizational commitment has become the focus of researchers, including Miao et al. (2010), Mahdi et al. (2013), Shagholi et al. (2010), Bell & Mjoli (2014), and Banjarnahor et al. (2018). The research results by Shagholi et al. (2010) revealed that there is an empirical and theoretical relationship between participative leadership and organizational commitment. Miao et al. (2010) tested whether participative leadership helps organization commitment in the Chinese public sector; the results show a significant relationship between the two variables. The empirical research strengthens the hypothesis built in this study, so that the following hypothesis is obtained: H2 Military Participative leadership has been associated with organizational commitment.

Strong organizational Commitment will ultimately improve personnel performance; this can be proven because a strong belief indicates high organizational Commitment to the values and goals of the organization, the desire to achieve organizational goals and the strength to maintain their position as part of the organization (Sopiah, 2008). Yamali, (2018). In their research, Rose et al. (2009) revealed that increasing organizational Commitment would improve performance among community service managers, meaning that organizational commitment has a positive relationship with personnel performance. Performance requires a situation where members of the organization have a strong commitment to the organization. Human factors play an important role in maintaining the organization's existence; for this reason, the emotions, attitudes, motivations, and behavior of personnel are critical for the organization (Imamoglu, 2019).

In the military environment, there is unlimited loyalty in the form of a willingness to be a pioneer for the unit, and this is following Imamoglu (2019), who states that organizational Commitment allows personnel to fulfill their responsibilities with motivation and even volunteering in line with organizational goals. Several studies that show the relationship between organizational commitment and personnel performance include: Wright and Bonnet (2002), Jafri and Lhamo (2013), Eliyana et al. (2019), Yamali (2018), Assumeraja (2007), Imamoglu et al. (2019), Suharto et al. (2019), Folorunso (2014), Setiawan and Gunawan (2018) and Rose et al. (2009). Organizational commitment and employee competency are related to each other (Rizki & Sulistyan, 2022). Employees have a high commitment to their organization, so they will use all their abilities or competency values possessed by the employee to carry out their work, which will ultimately create effective and efficient performance (Fard et al., 2022). Without realizing it, many parties state that employee commitment and competence are important factors in improving employee performance, but in practice, not all organizations are able to make this happen. One example is several employees where it is seen that employee performance has not shown optimal conditions. The facts include that there are still several complaints from employees about carrying out their work, not being disciplined in carrying out their work, often leaving early, coming to the office late, leaving the office without official permission and also extending rest hours. This is a clear symptom of disrupting employee performance in an organization so that several improvements need to be made to improve employee performance. The empirical research strengthens the hypothesis built in this study, so that the following hypothesis is obtained:

H3. Organizational Commitment is associated with Personnel Performance.

The literacy test results of several studies of the relationship between Participative Leadership and personnel performance found that there were still inconsistencies, meaning that there were empirical studies that stated that Participative Leadership was significantly related to personnel performance and vice versa. Therefore, to ensure the success of this research and as an element of fulfilling the novelty of the research, the researcher places organizational commitment as a mediating variable. It is in line with the research of Rose et al. (2009), which in their study indicated

that organizational commitment could act as a mediator, then organization commitment also mediates the relationship between leadership behavior and task performance (Yousef, 1999, in Rose et al., 2009).

Research that suggests that organization commitment plays a role as a mediator of the relationship between Participative Leadership and personnel performance is stated by Yeh and Hong (2012), Yousef (2000), Raveendran and Gamage (2019) and Steyrer et al. (2008). In order to sharpen the influence of Participative Leadership on personnel performance, mediating variables are needed, as well as closing the gap, so that it is hoped that this research can make a real contribution to the selection of Participative Leadership towards improving the performance of personnel in the military environment in particular. The placement of organizational commitment as a mediating variable is supported by the research of Yeh and Hong (2012), which suggests that the Participative Leadership style is important to motivate personnel commitment to improving performance. Still, in this research, it was stated that organization commitment holds a partial mediating effect between the relationship between Participative Leadership and performance. Yiing et al. (2009) added that leadership style would affect organizational commitment, and subsequently, organizational Commitment will improve performance and also mediate the relationship between leadership style and performance. The empirical research strengthens the hypothesis built in this study, so that the following hypothesis is obtained:

H4. Organizational Commitment mediates the influence of Military Participative Leadership on Personnel Performance.

The researcher added remuneration as a moderating variable to strengthen the relationship between the variables above. The concept of the relationship formed is that remuneration moderates the influence of participative military leadership on personnel performance. In an organization that prioritizes professionalism and transparency, a leader must be able to realize rewards and punishments for the performance of their personnel. It is in line with the research of Yeh and Hong (2012), where managers must realize appropriate rewards or remuneration when they can achieve work goals to maintain performance in the future. Rogiesta et al. (2018) also support a moderating relationship between Participative Leadership and personnel performance. Musrianadi et al. (2015), Danuji and Rahadini (2012), Kyule et al. (2016) and Mitas et al. (2014) are researchers who place remuneration as a moderating variable to strengthen the influence of leadership style on employee performance. The empirical research strengthens the hypothesis built in this study, so that the following hypothesis is obtained:

H5. Remuneration moderates the influence of Military Participative Leadership on Personnel Performance.

METHODS

A quantitative approach is used to analyze the relationship between variables in this study. The research was carried out on the Central Implementing Agency (Central Implementing Agency) of the Army as many as 31 work units located directly under the line of the Indonesian Army Headquarters Command, which is the executor of the main branch functions with the tasks of a) Personnel development, b) Development of the main defense system equipment, c) Material coaches according to their respective branches, and d) The value of the managed budget is Rp. 4,902,844,634,000, spread over the Jakarta and Bandung areas. The number of sample elements in this study was 310 respondents. This study develops four research variables, namely military participative leadership, organization commitment, remuneration and personnel performance, which are a combination of independent or exogenous variables, intervening variables, moderating



variables and dependent or endogenous variables. The scale used in this study is a Likert scale. The statistical testing tool used in this research is SmartPLS 3.0. The variables in this study are described as: Personnel Performance = KP; Military Participative Leadership = MPL; Organizational Commitment = OC; and Remuneration = RM.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

This study involved all treasury officials in the Work Unit with characteristics including Age, Gender, Education, Position and Income. Respondents in this study were financial administration staff or treasury officers of the central implementing agency of the TNI AD with positions in Jakarta and Bandung, as presented in the Recapitulation of Description of Respondents' Characteristics. The gender of the respondents involved in this study was predominantly male, with 251 people or 81%, while women were 59 people or 19%. The composition of respondents involved in this study was filled with 1 person under 20 years old, 48 people aged 20-29 years old, 30-39 years old, as many as 61 people, 40-49 years old, as many as 157 people and over 50 years old, as many as 43 people. The lowest percentage of respondents at 0.3% is under 20 years old, while the highest is 50.6% in the 40-49 year age range. Respondents of the treasury personnel of the TNI AD are mostly those with Senior High School education, as many as 151 people or 48.7%, Diploma III as many as 16 people or 5.2%, Strata 1 as many as 107 people or 34.5% and Strata 2 as many as 36 people or 11.6%. The positions of the respondents in this study consisted of 111 Paying Order Signing Officers, 28 Expenditure Treasurers (BP), 9 Assistant Expenditure Treasurers, 14 Accrual-Based Internal Accounting System Operators (SAIBA), and Accounting Management Information System Operators. State Property as many as 12 people, Verification Officer of financial administration accountability as many as 18 people and other positions as many as 118 people. Most of the respondents involved are in the income range of Rp. 5 - 7.5 million per month, which is 138 people or 44.5%. The results of the validity test are divided into two, namely, Convergent validity test (with AVE parameter > 0.5; Communality > 0.5; Outer Loadings > 0.7) and discriminant validity (with AVE Root parameter > AVE; Crossloading). The results of the convergent validity test are described in Table 1:

Table 1. AVE dan Communality

Construct	AVE	Community
KP	0,648	0,648
MPL	0,662	0,662
OC	0,735	0,735
RM	0,699	0,699

Source: Data processed 2021

Convergent validity can also be evaluated through outer loading; the general rule is that the outer loading value is expected to be above 0.7. Moreover, all of the values of the outer loading are more than 0.7. The results of the discriminant validity test are described in Table 2:

Table 2. AVE Square Root

Construct	AVE	KP	MPL	OC	RM
KP	0,648	0,805			
MPL	0,662	0,679	0,813		
OC	0,735	0,737	0,771	0,857	
RM	0,699	0,716	0,777	0,675	0,836

Source: Data processed 2021



Convergent validity can also be evaluated through cross-loading; a general rule is that the cross-loading value is expected to be higher than the correlation value of the indicator with other constructs. The results show that the cross-loading value has met the test requirements.

Reliability can be measured using composite reliability and Cronbach's alpha using the SmartPLS application. The construct is said to be reliable if the composite reliability value is 0.7 and the Cronbach alpha value is greater than 0.6 (Ghozali and Latan, 2020). Reliability shows the accuracy, consistency and reliability of a research instrument. The results of the reliability test are shown in Table 3 below:

Table 3. Cronbach's Alpha dan Composite Reliability

Construct	Cronbach's Alpha	Composite Reliability
KP	0,728	0,847
MPL	0,915	0,932
OC	0,940	0,951
RM	0,908	0,936

Source: Data processed 2021

Structural model testing is done by looking at the R-square value of each endogenous variable, the rule of thumb or a generally accepted rule of thumb that the R-square value is 0.75, 0.50 and 0.25, concluded that the model is strong, moderate and weak (Hair et al., 2011 in Ghozali and Latan, 2020). The results of these tests are described in Table 4 below:

Table 4. R-square

Endogen Variables	R Square	R Square Adjusted
KP	0,668	0,663
OC	0,595	0,593

Source: Data processed 2021

The R-square value or the coefficient of determination above shows that the R-square value simultaneously or simultaneously MPL and RM to KP is 0.668 or 66.8% with an R-Square Adjusted value of 0.663 or 66.3%, meaning the influence of exogenous constructs simultaneously on the endogenous construct by 66.3%, including moderate.

The results of the hypothesis testing of direct and indirect relationships are described in Table 5 below:

Table 5. Hypotheses Testing Result

Hypotheses	Original Sample (O)	Sample Mean (M)	Standard Deviation (STDEV)	T Statistics (O/STDEV)	Description
MPL → KP	0,120	0,112	0,070	1,712	Accepted
MPL → OC	0,771	0,773	0,028	27,641	Accepted
OC → KP	0,502	0,507	0,069	7,244	Accepted
RM → KP	0,288	0,289	0,049	5,893	Accepted
MPL > OC > KP (mediating)	0,387	0,392	0,061	6,316	Accepted
Moderating Effect 1 > KP	0,168	0,169	0,031	5,420	Accepted

Source: Data processed 2021



Hypothesis 1 about the effect of MPL on personnel performance is shown in the T-statistical test of 1.712, and the P-value of 0.044 is supported and significant. The performance of personnel will increase every time there is an effort to improve the participatory military leadership style. The MPL style, according to the results of partial interviews during the conduct of the research, will greatly affect the psychological aspects of team members, the atmosphere of openness, appreciation for the acceptance of group members' ideas and the involvement of all team members in setting goals and how to complete targets will receive broad support from members.

Such leadership criteria do not mean a weak chain of command, because the final decision remains with the Commander or field leader, and this follows the existing Commander and Staff Relations Procedure (Proshub). The results of this study expand the research concept of Lumbasi et al. (2016), Mehrabi et al. (2013), Odoardi et al. (2018), Dalluay and Jalagat (2016), Alfanny (2018), Ebrahim (2018), Newman (2012), Rozy et al. (2019), Ikbal et al. (2015), Gholamreza et al. (2019), and Akpoviroro et al. (2018), which states that participative leadership has a significant effect on performance. Military Participative Leadership has a positive and significant effect on personnel performance, meaning that an increase in participatory military leadership will increase personnel performance.

Military leadership with a participatory style will increase the sense of belonging and a strong

Leaders who provide a wide interaction space impact a high sense of respect and sense of belonging of the personnel; this becomes a strong asset for the organization to set goals and targets that can be achieved realistically. The form of organizational Commitment consists of affective, normative and sustainable Commitment. Miao (2010), in his research, has shown that participatory leadership has a significant effect on affective and normative Commitment but somewhat less on continuance commitment. The hope that the participative military model can be used in the military environment is supported by the relationship with organizational commitment; the thing that underlies this statement is the existence of an esprit de corps culture in the military environment, which is quite thick. Research has proven that a participatory military leadership style can increase organizational Commitment, which is highly expected by all commanders/leaders in the military environment.

The high level of organizational Commitment through participative military leadership is an opportunity that the leadership can utilize to reduce the level of violations, disciplinary actions, desertions, and other soldiers' problems. The results of the study have expanded on previous researchers, among others; Miao et al. (2010), Mahdi et al. (2013), Shagholi et al. (2010), Bell & Mjoli (2014), Banjarnahor et al. (2018), that there is a significant relationship between participative military leadership and organizational commitment, with the results of Hypothesis 2 test shown in the T-statistical test of 27.641 and the P-value of 0.000 has been supported and significant. Therefore, military Participative Leadership has a positive and significant effect on Commitment, meaning that an increase in participative military leadership will increase organizational Commitment.

Strong organizational Commitment will improve personnel performance. The positive Commitment of individuals to the organization is the main capital for organizations to face increasingly complex global challenges. Organizational Commitment needs to be continuously maintained so that there is no decrease in personnel and organizational performance; the results of research by Wright and Bonnet (2002) indicate that there is very strong evidence of a relationship between organizational Commitment and performance, but the results of the correlation coefficient based on years of service show that in general the relationship between organizational Commitment is with a very strong performance in new employees and tends to decrease with increasing age of

employees. These findings are a concern, and additional research insights considering that 64.5% of personnel placed in the financial administration of the Army Central service agency Work Unit are over 40 years old. Personnel with organizational Commitment will show behavior that supports the organization's interests (Imamoglu, 2019); the organization must ensure that the personnel or members of the organization view themselves as part of the organization because personnel are the most important asset in determining the success of the organization.

Organizational Commitment has a positive and significant effect on personnel performance, meaning that an increase in organizational Commitment will increase personnel performance. Affective Commitment relates to individual characteristics, job descriptions, skills or job specialization, interactions with leaders, age, and tenure. A person with high affective Commitment will exert their abilities to better the organization. Normative Commitment has the characteristics of membership status in the organization, such as a work contract and a binding moral attitude. Someone who feels comfortable will have a high normative commitment and increase performance. While continuous Commitment is more about the mutual need and economic factors, individuals who feel financially comfortable and have a good work status will improve performance for the organization. Hypothesis 3 with a T-statistical value of 7.244 and a P-value of 0.000 indicates that there is a significant and significant relationship between organizational commitment and personnel performance, which means strengthening previous research, including; Wright and Bonnet (2002), Jafri and Lhamo (2013), Folorunso (2014), Yamali (2018), Assumeraja (2007), Imamoglu et al. (2019), Suharto et al. (2019), Eliyana et al. (2019), Setiawan and Gunawan (2018) and Rose et al. (2009).

The results of the study underline that although it is proven that the influence of participative military leadership can improve personnel performance, other efforts from human resource management are still needed in the form of increasing organizational Commitment consisting of affective, normative and sustainable commitments, Normative Commitment (OC3) in particular from the statement "The organization deserves my loyalty" (OC33) as an indicator and item from the latent organizational commitment construct has the largest outer loading value, which is 0.927, as well as Continuing Commitment (OC2), especially from the statement "There are too many things in my life that will be disrupted if I decide to leave now" (OC22) is a capital or opportunity for organizations to take advantage of in order to increase organizational Commitment. The statement that the organization deserves my loyalty is a form of the individual's sense of responsibility and belief in their role in the organization. They have felt valued and received adequate feedback from the leadership and co-workers; this condition must be maintained as a driver for improving personnel performance.

The statement that too many things in my life would be disrupted if I decided to leave now was the individual's sense of dependence on the organization for the financial benefits he received for his family's well-being. It is also an opportunity that management must continue to take advantage of to maintain ideal conditions in the face of the inflation rate and personnel purchasing power. The T-statistic value of Hypothesis 4 is 1.712, and the P-value is 0.044, it is proven and significant, 2) tests whether the exogenous variable has a significant effect on the mediating variable or participative military leadership has a significant effect on organization commitment, with a T-statistic value of 27.641 and P-value 0.000 is proven and significant, and 3) simultaneously tested the effect of the mediating variable, exogenous on endogenous variables with the results of the study proving that the T-statistical value of 6.316 > 1.64 and P-value 0.000 < 0.05 supports that organizational commitment as a mediating variable is accepted and signed, and strengthens previous research conducted by Yeh and Hong (2012), Yousef (2000), Raveendran and Gamage (2019) and Steyrer et al. (2008). Organizational Commitment as a mediator also needs special



attention, especially from the affective commitment indicator (OC1) item 'Strong sense of belonging to the organization' (OC11), with the lowest outer loading value compared to other items, namely 0.783. The ideal outer loading value above 0.7 has indeed been fulfilled, but it becomes the organization's concern when the interval is too minimal. A sense of belonging that is not too high does not mean a low sense of belonging to the TNI institution. Another factor that might affect this value is the rotation or mutation factor, which is the tour of area or tour of duty. According to research by Wright and Bonnet (2002), boredom and tenure in one work unit can affect performance, so to anticipate the problems above, the organization must periodically pay attention to the time of one's assignment.

The results of testing hypothesis 5 prove that the T-statistical value of $5.420 > 1.64$ and the P-value $0.000 < 0.05$ support that remuneration as a moderating variable is accepted and significant, meaning the relationship between participative military leadership and personnel performance. Based on the theory of reinforcement of motivation put forward by Skinner, motivational reinforcement needs to be designed by organizations to ensure that members get positive consequences that will be repeated and negative consequences that tend not to be repeated. As part of the positive reinforcement function, Remuneration will encourage personnel to repeat their actions that lead to increased economic benefits. Employees inevitably work for rewards; the organization must have a remuneration structure that is adjusted to the performance results and job descriptions. Remuneration can be a tool to retain outstanding employees, attract prospective employees with certain qualities and competencies, and increase motivation (Pangestu, 2019).

The principles of performance allowances within the TNI include 1) to improve the welfare and performance of soldiers and civil servants, 2) a unified command of the policy of providing performance allowances in order to realize harmony and synergy between units, 3) solidity to create a sense of togetherness in carrying out unit tasks, 4) proportional, namely the performance allowance is given in a commensurate and balanced manner according to the class of position/workload, 5) accountability, namely the use of the budget in the provision of performance allowances can be accounted for. With this principle, it is hoped that the performance allowance will be able to improve the performance of personnel wherever they are assigned because it provides a comforting effect for families who are left on duty outside the unit's home base. Furthermore, Calvin (2017) argues that remuneration is a source of motivation for employee performance; Calvin also expresses employee participation in determining the payment of salaries, wages, bonuses and incentives to prevent negative effects on employee performance in both private and public companies. The recommendation has not yet become a culture within government organizations in Indonesia, but it can be used as a reference in preparing remuneration justice based on job class/workload.

CONCLUSION

Military participative leadership is formed from consultative indicators, joint decision-making, democratic management and personnel empowerment, which is sourced from the collaboration of military leadership concepts, contingency leadership theory and participatory leadership theory. The existing resources have significantly improved the performance of personnel in the Army Central service agency Work Unit, which integrates important factors, including participative military leadership, organization commitment and remuneration. The participatory military leadership style is the main key to the success of performance-based human resource management, both directly and indirectly affecting personnel performance, especially budget absorption, to support the implementation of all unit work programs. Military Participative



leadership is closely related to organizational commitment, which is reflected in personnel loyalty to the organization to which they are assigned. Military Participative leadership has a significant effect on organizational commitment and creates a strong sense of belonging, corporate spirit, and pride.

Organizational Commitment has also been shown to directly affect personnel performance with affective, normative and sustainable commitment indicators that are culturally embedded from the results of continuing education. Indirectly, organizational Commitment as a mediation affects the participative military leadership on personnel performance. The development of organizational Commitment must align with the organization's vision, mission, and goals. MPL will encourage increased organizational Commitment, and alternating organizational Commitment affects personnel performance and also mediates the relationship between MPL and personnel performance. Leadership style without organizational commitment support will be difficult to influence performance improvement. Remuneration can act as a moderator between participative military leadership and performance. In the study, although not specifically discussing the direct relationship between remuneration and performance, the path coefficient table shows that there is a direct influence between remuneration and personnel performance. Remuneration should be further developed as a motivating factor for work morale.

Research on leadership style has always been the prima donna associated with performance, and it will enrich the leadership theory if a different approach is used, both in terms of application and the population studied. This study focuses on financial administration personnel in the work unit, so it is necessary to examine the characteristics of personnel with other assignments in the military environment, either simultaneously or different in employment status between the military and civil servants. Further research is also expected to develop other variables, such as the adoption of technology and information, and the government's role, to see what external dimensions can affect performance in the military environment.

REFERENCES

- Abdurrohman, M. & Marsus, S. (2017). Factor Analysis for Slow Budget Realization, *International Journal of Innovation and Economic Development*, ISSN 1849-7020, Vol 3 2017 28-50
<https://doi.org/10.18775/ijied.1849-7551-7020.2015.31.2002>
- Akpvororo, K.S., Owotutu, S.O., Olufemi, A. A. (2018). Effect of Participative Leadership Style on Employees' Productivity, *International Journal of Economic Behavior*, vol. 8, n. 1, 2018, 47-60
https://doi.org/10.24132/jbt.2018.8.2.48_58
- Alfanny, J. (2018). Analysis of Leadership Style on Performance (Case Study Employee of Directorate of Infrastructure Investment Development, Ministry of Public Works and Housing), *Journal Sosial Humaniora (JSH) 2018*, Volume 11, Ed. 1 ISSN Online: 2443-3527 ISSN Print: 1979-5521
- Alfayes, M. H. (2016). Meaning of Equity Theory and Leaders in Organizations prioritize it, *International Journal of Scientific & Engineering Research*, Volume 7, Issue 3, March 2016, ISSN 2229-5518
<https://doi.org/10.12962/j24433527.v11i1.3695>
- Alshery, W. R., Ahmad, F., Swidi, A. K. (2015). The Moderating Effect of Role Ambiguity on the Relationship of Job Satisfaction, Training and Leadership with Employee Performance, *International Journal of Business Administration* Vol. 6, No. 2; 2015
<https://doi.org/10.5430/ijba.v6n2p30>



- Alwaki, M. N. (2018). An Evaluation of the Impact of Remuneration on Employee Attitude and Performance in Organizations, *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences* Vol. 8, No. 7, July 2018, Pg 410-420, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 <https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBS/v8-i7/4383>
- Armstrong, M. (2007). *Employee Reward Management and Practice*, Kogan Page, Philadelphia (Manus dan Graham, 2003).
- Anggapraja, I. T., dan Wijaya, R. (2007). Effect of Commitment, Organization, Organizational Culture, and Motivation on the Performance of Employees, *Journal of Applied Management (JAM)* Volume 15 Number 1, March 2017, ISSN: 1693-5241 <https://doi.org/10.18202/jam23026332.15.1.10>
- Arikunto, S. (2010). *Prosedur Penelitian*, Rineka Cipta, Yogyakarta
- Arnold, J. A., Arad, S., Rhoades, A., Drasgow, F. (2000). The empowering leadership questionnaire: The construction and validation of a new scale for measuring leader behaviors, *Journal of Organizational Behavior* J. Organiz. Behav. 21, 249-269 [https://doi.org/10.1002/\(SICI\)1099-1379\(200005\)21:3%3C249::AID-JOB10%3E3.0.CO;2-#](https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1099-1379(200005)21:3%3C249::AID-JOB10%3E3.0.CO;2-#)
- Armanu Thoyib, Noemijati, Rosita, N.H. (2016). "The Role of Organizational Culture and Human Resource Management Practices in Strengthening the Effect of Leadership on Knowledge Sharing". *Journal of Management and Marketing Review* 1(1) 72 - 80 (2016) [https://doi.org/10.35609/jmmr.2016.1.1\(9\)](https://doi.org/10.35609/jmmr.2016.1.1(9))
- Ayazlar, G. dan Guzler, B. (2013). The Effect of Loneliness in the Workplace on Organizational Commitment, *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 131(2014) 319 - 325 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.04.124>
- Banjarnahor, H., Hutabarat, W., Sibuea, M., & Situmorang, M. (2018). Job Satisfaction as a Mediator between Directive and Participatory Leadership Styles toward Organizational Commitment, *International Journal of Instruction*, October 2018, Vol. 11, No.4, e-ISSN: 1308-1470 <https://doi.org/10.12973/iji.2018.11455a>
- Bell, C. & Mjoli, T. (2014). The effects of participative leadership on organizational Commitment: Comparing its effects on two gender groups among bank clerks, *African Journal of Business Management*, Vol. 8(12), pp. 451-459, 28 June 2014 <https://doi.org/10.5897/AJBM2013.7028>
- Calvin, O.Y. (2017). The Impact of Remuneration on Employees' Performance (A Study of Abdul Gusau Polytechnic, Talata-Mafara and State College of Education Maru, Zamfara State), *Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review (Nigerian Chapter)* Vol. 4, No. 2, 2017 <https://doi.org/10.12816/0037554>
- Campbell, J. P., & Wiernick, B. M. (2015). The Modeling and Assessment of Work Performance, *Annu. Rev. Organ. Psychol. Organ. Behav.* 2015.2:47-74. University of Minnesota <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-orgpsych-032414-111427>
- Dalluay, V. S., & Jalagat, R. C. (2016). Impacts of Leadership Style Effectiveness of Managers and Department Heads on Employees' Job Satisfaction and Performance on Selected Small-Scale Businesses in Cavite, Philippines, *International Journal of Recent Advances in Organizational Behavior and Decision Sciences (IJRAOB)* An Online International Research Journal (ISSN: 2311-3197) 2016 Vol: 2 Issue: 2
- Diamantidis, A. & Chatzoglou, P. (2019). Factors affecting employee performance: an empirical approach, *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management* Vol. 68 No. 1, 2019

pp. 171-193 © Emerald Publishing Limited 1741-0401 <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJPPM-01-2018-0012>

- Donaldson, L. & Davis, J. H. (1991). Stewardship Theory of Agency Theory, *Australian Journal of Management*, Vol. 16 <https://doi.org/10.1177/031289629101600103>
- Dubrin, A. J., Dalglish, C., Miller, P. (2006). *Leadership*, 2nd Asia-Pacific Edition
- Ebrahim, H. K. (2018). Impact of Leadership Styles on Organizational Performance, *IBIMA Publishing Journal of Human Resources Management Research* Vol. 2018 (2018), Article ID 687849, 10 pages, ISSN: 2166-0018
- Edward, J.S. (2016). Analysis on Ministries, State Organization and Regional Government Low Budget Absorption, *Journal Rechts Vinding*, Vol 5 No 2 2016 Hal 261. ISSN 2089-9009
- Eliyana, A., Ma'arif, S., Muzakki. (2019). Job satisfaction and organizational Commitment affect in the transformational leadership towards employee performance, *European Research on Management and Business Economics* 25 (2019) 144-150 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iedeen.2019.05.001>
- Erlina, Saputra, A., Muda, I. (2019). The analysis of the Influencing Factors of Budget Absorption, *IJER*, ISSN 0972-9380 Vol 14, No. 12, 2017
- Falco, S.E., dan Renzi, A. (2015). Agency Theory, Stewardship Theory and Residual Right: Logics and Interpretative Models, *Encontros científicos*.
- Ferdinand, A. (2014). *Metode Penelitian Manajemen*, *Pustaka Kunci*, Undip Press, Semarang
- Folorunso, O.O., Adewale, A.J., Abodunde, S.M. (2014). Exploring the Effect of Organizational Commitment Dimensions on Employees' Performance: An Empirical Evidence from Academic Staff of Oyo State Owned Tertiary Institutions, Nigeria, *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences* August 2014, Vol. 4, No. 8 ISSN: 2222-6990 <https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBS/v4-i8/1096>
- Gholamreza, Z., Aslam, A., Nasir, M.U. (2019). Effect of Participative Leadership and Employees Training on Organizational Productivity: A Study of E&E Sector in Malaysia, *Academy of Entrepreneurship Journal* Volume 25, Special Issue 2, 2019
- Ghosh, S dan Swamy, D. R. (2014). A Literature Review on Organizational Commitment - A Comprehensive Summary, *Int. Journal of Engineering Research and Applications* ISSN: 2248-9622, Vol. 4, Issue 12(Part 1), December 2014, pp.04-14
- Gordan, M. dan Krishnan, I. A. (2014). A Review of B. F. Skinner's 'Reinforcement Theory of Motivation', *Journal: International Journal of Research in Education Methodology* Vol 5, No. 3 ISSN 2278-7690 <https://doi.org/10.24297/ijrem.v5i3.3892>
- Hersey, P. dan Blanchard, K. (1995). *Manajemen Perilaku Organisasi*. Erlangga. Jakarta
- House, R.J., dan Mitchell, T.R. (1975). *Path-Goal Leadership*, NTIS US Dept of Commerce, Univ of Washington Seattle
- Ikbal, N., Anwar, S., dan Haider, N. (2015). Effect of Leadership Style on Employee Performance, *Arabian J Bus Manag Review* Volume 5 • Issue 5 • 1000146 ISSN: 2223-5833
- Imamoglu, S.Z., Ince, H., Turkcan, H., dan Atakay, B. (2019). The effect of organizational justice and organizational Commitment on knowledge sharing and firm performance, *Procedia Computer Science* 158 (2019) 899-906 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2019.09.129>
- Jafri, M.H., dan Lhamo, T. (2013). Organizational Commitment and Work Performance in Regular and Contract Faculties of Royal University of Bhutan, *Journal of Contemporary Research in Management* Vol. 8, No.2 April - June, 2013



- Kaur, A. (2013). Maslow's Need Hierarchy Theory: Applications and Criticisms, *Global Journal of Management and Business Studies*. ISSN 2248-9878 Volume 3, Number 10 (2013), pp. 1061-1064
- Kellett, S. P. (1980). "A Study of the Relationship Between Leadership Style & Gender". Army Command & General Staff College. New York
- Kessler, E.H. (2013). *Encyclopedia of Management Theory*, Sage Reference, Pace University
<https://doi.org/10.4135/9781452276090>
- King, A.S. (1990). Evolution of Leadership Theory, *Indian Council of Social Science Research Publications*, Vol. 15, No.2, April-June 1990
- Kyule, A.K., Katunzi, T., Arasa, R. (2016). The Moderating Effect of Remuneration on the Relationship Between Work-Life Policies and Employee Work Outcomes Among Lecturers in Kenya, *International Journal of Economics, Commerce and Management UK Vol IV Issue 9* ISSN 2348 0366 Pg 276-285
- Lewin, K., Lippitt, R., dan White, R.K. (1939). Patterns of Aggressive Behavior in Experimentally Created "Social Climate", *The Journal of Social Psychology*, SPSSI Bulletin, 1939, 10, 271-299
<https://doi.org/10.1080/00224545.1939.9713366>
- Lor, W. dan Hasan, Z. (2017). The Influence of Leadership on Employee Performance Among Jewelry Artisans in Malaysia, *International Journal of Accounting & Business Management*, Vol. 5 (No.1), April, 2017, ISSN: 2289-4519
- Lumbasi, G., K'Aol, G., dan Ouma, C.A. (2016). The Effect of Participative Leadership Style on the Performance of COYA Senior Managers in Kenya, *Research Journal's Journal of Management* Vol. 4 | No. 5 July | 2016 ISSN 2347-8217
- Lunenbergh, F.C. (2011). Expectancy Theory of Motivation: Motivating by Altering Expectations, *International Journal of Management, Business, and Administration* Volume 15, Number 1, 2011
- Mahdi, O.R., Mohd, E.S.G., Amsafir, M.K. (2013). Empirical Study on the Impact of Leadership Behavior on Organizational Commitment in Plantation Companies in Malaysia, 2nd World Conference on Business, Economics and Management -WCBEM 2013
- Mehrabi, J., Safaei, N., Kazemi, A. (2013). Studying the Effect of Leaders' Participative Behaviors on Employees' Effectiveness Perception and Performance, *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, January 2013, Vol. 3, No. 1, ISSN: 2222-6990
<https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBS/v3-i7/44>
- Meier, D. (2016). Situational Leadership Theory as a Foundation for a Blended Learning Framework, *Journal of Education and Practice*, ISSN 2222-1735, Vol. 7, No.10, 2016
- Mihrez, H.E., dan Armanu Thoyib. (2014). The Importance of Leadership Behavior and Motivation in Creating Employee Performance, *Asia-Pacific Management and Business Application* 3(2) 86 - 105, ISSN: 2252-8997 <https://doi.org/10.21776/ub.apmba.2014.003.02.2>
- Mitas, Y.A., Chan, S., Dharma, S. (2014). Peranan Kompensasi Sebagai Variabel Moderasi Dalam Pengaruh Motivasi Kerja, Kepuasan Kerja Dan Gaya Kepemimpinan Terhadap Kinerja Pegawai, *Artikel Program Pascasarjana Univ Bung Hatta* Vol 5 No 2
- Mguqulwa, M. (2008). The Relationship Between Organizational Commitment and Work Performance in an Agricultural Company, *Industrial and Organizational Psychology at the University Of South Africa*

- Mujani, K.W., Jamsari, E.A., Samah, N.H. (2012). Leadership Theories and Models from the Perspective of Western Scholars, *Advances in Natural and Applied Sciences*, 6(8): 1405-1410, 2012 ISSN 1995-0772
- Newman, A. (2012). The role of participative leadership and trust-based mechanisms in eliciting intern performance: Evidence from China, AUT Business School, Auckland University of Technology, Auckland, New Zealand
- Odoardi, C., Battitelli, A., Mintani, F., dan Peir, J.M. (2018). Affective Commitment, Participative Leadership, and Employee Innovation: A Multilevel Investigation, *Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology* (2019) 35(2) 103-113 <https://doi.org/10.5093/jwop2019a12>
- Ozlen, M.K., dan Zukic, A. (2013). A Descriptive Study on the Military Leadership, *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, July 2013, Vol. 3, No. 7, ISSN: 2222-6990 <https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBS/v3-i7/102>
- Patiar, A. dan Wang, Y. (2020). Managers' leadership, compensation and benefits, and departments' performance: Evidence from upscale hotels in Australia, *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 1447-6770 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhtm.2019.11.005>
- Pradhan, R.K., dan Jena, L.K. (2017). Employee Performance at Workplace: Conceptual Model and Empirical Validation, *Business Perspectives and Research* 5(1) 1-17 <https://doi.org/10.1177/2278533716671630>
- Priyono. (2016). Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Zifatama Publishing, Surabaya
- Ramay, M.I. (2010). Influence of Leadership Behavior and Participatory Decision Making on the Employees' Organizational Commitment. Department of Engineering Management, Center for Advanced Studies in Engineering, University of Engineering and Technology, Taxila
- Razak, N.A., Jaafar, S.N., Hamidon, N.I., Zakaria, N. (2015). Leadership Styles of Lecturers' Technical and Vocational in Teaching and Learning, *Journal of Education and Practice* ISSN 2222-1735 (Paper) ISSN 2222-288X Vol. 6, No.13, 2015
- Reiter, D. dan Wagstaff, W.A. (2018). Leadership and Military Effectiveness, *Foreign Policy Analysis* (2018) 14, 490-511 <https://doi.org/10.1093/fpa/orx003>
- Rinker, T. (2014). The Treatment of Likert Data, Department of Learning and Instruction CEP 510: Psychometric Theory in Education, University at Buffalo
- Robbins, S. P. dan Colter, M. (1996). Management, Pearson Education International.
- Rose, R.C., Kumar, N., Ong, G. Pak. (2009). The Effect of Organizational Learning on Organizational Commitment, Job Satisfaction and Work Performance, *The Journal of Applied Business Research*, November/December 2009 Volume 25, Number 6 <https://doi.org/10.19030/jabr.v25i6.995>
- Rozy, R., Ka'ol, G., Kirubi, M. (2019). Effect of Participative Leadership Style on Employee Performance of Coffee Trading Companies in Kenya, *Journal of Human Resource and Leadership*, ISSN 2519-9099 (online) Vol. 4, Issue 2, pp 29 - 57, 2019
- Sekaran U. dan Bougie, R. (2016). Research Methods for Business, Wiley, UK
- Setiawan, D.P., dan Gunawan, H. (2018). The Effect of Job Satisfaction and Organization Commitment to Job Performance Through Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) As Meditation Variable, *Business and Entrepreneurial Review* Vol. 18, No.1, April 2018 E-ISSN: 2252-4614 Page 1 - 18 <https://doi.org/10.25105/ber.v18i1.5175>



- Singh, K. (2016). Influence of Internal Service Quality on Job Performance, 6th International Research Symposium in Service Management, IRSSM-6 2015, 11-15 August 2015, UiTM Sarawak, Kuching, Malaysia
- Shagholi, R., Hussin, S., Siraj, S., Naimie, Z., Feresteh, A. dan Moayed, F. (2010). Current thinking and future view: participatory management, a dynamic system for developing organizational Commitment, *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences* 2 (2010) 250-254
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2010.03.006>
- Smith, J. (2014). *The Heart of Leadership, Military Leadership in the 21st Century*.
- Sonnetag, S., Volmer, J., Spsychala, A. (2010). Job Performance, First publ. in: *Micro approaches (Sage handbook of organizational behavior; vol. 1) / ed. by Julian Barling Los Angeles, Calif. [u.a.]: SAGE*, pp. 427-447 <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781849200448.n24>
- Storsletten, M.L., dan Jakobsen, D. (2016). Development of Leadership Theory in the Perspective of Kierkegaard's Philosophy, *J Bus Ethics*
- Sugiyono. (2017). *Metode Penelitian Bisnis*, Alfabeta, Bandung
- Suharto, Suyanto, dan Hendri, N. (2019). The Impact of Organizational Commitment on Job Performance, *International Journal of Economics and Business Administration* Volume VII, Issue 2, 2019 pp. 189-206 <https://doi.org/10.35808/ijeba/227>
- Suong, H.T.T. (2020). The impact of transformational leadership on motivation of employees, *WSEAS Transaction on Business and Economics* Vol 17 2020 E ISSN 2224-2899
- Susanto, Y. (2012). "Kebijakan Pembinaan Personel TNI AD". *Journal Yudhagama* Vol 32 No. 2
- Syawal, M., Bua, H., Madjid, R. (2019). The Effect of Remuneration, Working Environment, and Working Discipline on Employee Performance, *JUMBO* Vol. 3, No.1, April 2019, hal.77-88. e-ISSN 2502-4175
- Tolentino, R.C. (2013). Organizational Commitment and Job Performance of the Academic and Administrative Personnel, *International Journal of Information Technology and Business Management*, 29 July 2013. Vol. 15 No.1 ISSN 2304-0777
- Warmansyah, (2019). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*, Alfabeta, Bandung
- Williams, M.L., Brower, H., Ford, R. L., Williams, L.J., Carraher. S.M. (2008). A comprehensive model and measure of compensation satisfaction, *Journal of Occupational and Organizational Psychology* (2008), 81, 639-668. 2008 The British Psychological Society
<https://doi.org/10.1348/096317907X248851>
- William, Paolo D.C. (2011). *Styles of leadership in the Brazilian Army: an analysis of conceptual evolution*. Army Command & General Staff College. Brazil
- Wright, T.A., dan Bonnet, D.G. (2002). The Moderating Effects of Employee Tenure on the Relation Between Organizational Commitment and Job Performance: A Meta-Analysis, *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 2002. Vol. 87. No. 6. 1183-1190 <https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.87.6.1183>
- Yamali, F.R. (2018). Effect of Compensation, Competencies and Organizational Culture on Organizational Commitment, its Implications on Experts' Performance of Construction Services Company in Jambi Province, *International Journal of Advances in Management and Economics*, ISSN: 2278-3369, Vol. 7 | Issue 2 | 29-42
- Zawahreh, A.A. dan Madi, F.A. (2012). The Utility of Equity Theory in Enhancing Organizational Effectiveness, *European Journal of Economics, Finance and Administrative Sciences*, ISSN 1450-2275, Issue 46 (2012)

